



The Navy League of the United States

Information Technology Committee

Web Site Evaluation Criteria for Mackie Awards

These criteria are meant to provide a consistent template for objectively evaluating Navy League web sites which establishes objectivity while allowing for the evaluator's subjectivity where the criteria give way to some judgment on the part of evaluators.

Each criterion will be scored as (+), (~), or (-) where the following quality associations can be made:

- (+) exceeds, excellent, outstanding, above, beyond (Meets criteria)
- (~) expected, minimal, average, also not applicable
- (-) below average, missing, does not meet (Does not meet criteria)

Evaluators tabulate the (+) (~) (-)'s within each web evaluation category and (if appropriate) may include subjective impressions of items of merit or demerit that are not explicitly covered by the criteria.

The ratings for each web evaluation category will be one of the following:

- (10 points) Superior
- (7 Points) Meets Most Criteria
- (5 Points) Acceptable (Meets at least half of the criteria)
- (3 Points) Needs Improvement (Meets fewer than half of criteria)
- (0 Points) Not Acceptable (Meets few criteria and not representative of NLUS)

Points for the six web evaluation categories are totaled for each web site and winners of Mackie Awards declared accordingly.

I. Authenticity

- (+) (~) (-) 1. Is the domain name/url a reasonable descriptor for the Council/ organization?
- (+) (~) (-) 2. Does the web site have a clear purpose, i. e., to educate and inform?
- (+)(-) 3. Is copyrighted material properly attributed to its source and author?
- (+)(-) 4. Is site content current and relevant?

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

II. Appearance

- (+) (~) (-) 1. Are the color combinations pleasing and appropriate for the site's purpose?
- (+) (~) (-) 2. Are the number of font faces and sizes used pleasing and appropriate?
- (+) (~) (-) 3. Are the page layouts balanced, clean, and uncluttered?
- (+) (~) (-) 4. Are the images smooth and properly anti-aliased to the background? (No jaggies or halos.)
- (+) (~) (-) 5. Are the graphics and pictures appropriate and relevant to the content of the site?
- (+) (~) (-) 6. Are your eyes directed to the content or important page elements?
- (+) (~) (-) 7. Is the text of sufficient size to be easily read?

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

III. Design and Navigation

- (+) (~) (-) 1. Is the content of the site logically organized?
- (+) (~) (-) 2. Is the navigation throughout the site simple to understand and use?
- (+) (-) 3. Is the use of the browser back button unnecessary (no dead end pages)?
- (+) (~) (-) 4. If icons or other images are used for navigation, are their meanings clear?
- (+) (~) (-) 5. If icons or other images are used for navigation, are text links also provided?
- (+) (~) (-) 6. Is the purpose of each page easily identified?
- (+) (~) (-) 7. Can users get to information with a minimal number of clicks (a good rule of thumb is no more than 3 clicks)?
- (+) (~) (-) 8. Does the navigation allow the user to easily backtrack or return to upper levels in the site?

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

IV. Web Site Content

- (+) (~) (-) 1. Is text content free from spelling, grammatical, and typographical errors?
- (+) (~) (-) 2. Where plausible are short sentences, short paragraphs, headings, and bulleted lists used so that the content can be easily scanned?

- (+) (~) (-) 3. Can specific content be easily found?
- (+) (~) (-) 4. For sites with large amounts of information, is a search function available?
- (+) (~) (-) 5. Do graphics complement and enhance the text?

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

V. Functionality

- (+) (~) (-) 1. Is the site cross-browser and cross-platform compatible? (At a minimum, does the site work for users of commonly available browsers, using either Mac or Windows operating systems?)
- (+) (~) (-) 2. Are navigation tabs, links, and graphics operable and give expected results?
- (+) (~) (-) 3. Are forms, links, or email provided to join/renew membership in the Navy League, make reservations for Council events, and communicate with Council leadership?
- (+) (~) (-) 4. Are all components of the site functional? (Links, forms, scripts, etc.)
- (+) (~) (-) 5. Is information concerning any special browser or plug-in requirements, e. g. adobe acrobat reader, clearly visible and easily understood?
- (+) (~) (-) 6. Are interactive features clearly explained?
- (+) (~) (-) 7. Are the skills required to use the site's features appropriate for its intended audience?
- (+)(-) 8. Is there an option to toggle on or off music (sound) and animation?
- (+)(-) 9. Does the site have accessibility features for disabled viewers?

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

VI. Security

- (+) (~) (-) 1. If online ordering is offered, are the products ordered on a secure/encrypted page? Look for the HTTPS:// in the URL, and the padlock in the address bar.

(+) (~) (-) 2. Are there any e-mail addresses on the site? If so, the site is subject to spammers either sending the site contact e-mail, or using that e-mail address as a false originator for spam. The site should have a Contact Us page where the visitor fills out a form that's sent to the web site content. And no visible (or hidden) e-mail addresses.

(+) (~) (-) 3. Does the site have a comprehensive Privacy Policy? While it doesn't relate to security of the web site, it goes far in assuring the web site visitor how any collected information is used.

TOTALS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____

SUM OF TOTALS OF ALL SIX CATEGORIES:

TOTAL POINTS: (+) _____ (~) _____ (-) _____ = _____